

**MARK SCHEME for the October/November 2010 question paper  
for the guidance of teachers**

**0470 HISTORY**

**0470/23**

Paper 2, maximum raw mark 50

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes must be read in conjunction with the question papers and the report on the examination.

- CIE will not enter into discussions or correspondence in connection with these mark schemes.

CIE is publishing the mark schemes for the October/November 2010 question papers for most IGCSE, GCE Advanced Level and Advanced Subsidiary Level syllabuses and some Ordinary Level syllabuses.



<b>Page 2</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2010</b>	<b>0470</b>	<b>23</b>

### 19<sup>th</sup> Century Option

**1 Study sources A and B. How far do these sources agree? Explain your answer using details from the sources.**

Level 1 Paraphrases sources, offers no comparison. [1]

Level 2 Finds information in one source that is not in the other. [2]

Level 3 Compares details for agreement or disagreement. [3–4]

Level 4 Compares details for both agreement and disagreement. [5–6]

Level 5 Gives overall message.

(i.e. blames both North and South). [7]

**2 Study sources C and D. Are you surprised by source D? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your own knowledge.**

Level 1 Unsupported assertions. Writes about the sources. [1]

Level 2 Suggests sources are written at different times. [2]

Level 3 Answer based on everyday empathy from D only.

e.g. Lincoln was a great man. [3–4]

Level 4 Surprised / not surprised based on content.

i.e. Compares C and D. [5–6]

Level 5 Cross references to other sources or contextual knowledge to explain why surprised / not surprised by source D. [7–8]

**3 Study sources E and F. How similar are the messages of these two cartoons? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your own knowledge.**

Level 1 Describes sources, no comparison. [1–2]

Level 2 Valid interpretation of one or both sources, no comparison. [3–4]

Level 3 Comparison of valid sub messages. [5–6]

Level 4 Comparison of big message. [7–8]

<b>Page 3</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2010</b>	<b>0470</b>	<b>23</b>

**4 Study sources G and H. Is one of these sources more reliable than the other? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your knowledge.**

Level 1 Describes sources / unsupported assertions. [1]

Level 2 Undeveloped provenance. [2–3]

Level 3 Comparison between G and H.

e.g. both reliable as agree Blacks treated badly. [3]

Level 4 Reliability judged by tone / language. [3–4]

Level 5 Cross references to other sources to judge reliability. [5–6]

Level 6 Answers based on purpose of sources – to judge reliability.

e.g. in H they are justifying the legislation. [7–8]

**5 Study source I. Was this cartoon published in the North or the South? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your knowledge.**

Level 1 Describes cartoon. [1]

Level 2 Claims it was from the North. Misinterprets the cartoon. Must be explained. [2–3]

Level 3 Claims it was from the South, must be explained. [4–5]

Level 4 Claims it was from the South based on the purpose of the South.  
(why would the South want to represent events in this way). [6–7]

**6 Study all the sources. How far do these sources provide convincing evidence that the failure of Reconstruction was the fault of the South? Use the sources to explain your answer.**

Level 1 No valid source use. [1–3]

Level 2 Uses sources to support or reject the statement. [4–6]

Level 3 Uses sources to support and reject the statement. [7–10]

Up to two bonus marks for any evaluation of sources  
(no more than one mark per source).

Source use must be by reference to a source by letter, by provenance or by a direct quote. There must be examples from source content.

Use Y in the margin for each source in support of the statement and N for each rejection of the statement.

<b>Page 4</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2010</b>	<b>0470</b>	<b>23</b>

### 20<sup>th</sup> Century Option

#### 1 Study sources A and B. How far do these sources agree? Explain your answer using details of the sources.

Level 1 Paraphrases sources, offers no comparison. [1]

Level 2 Finds information that is in one source but not in the other. [2]

Level 3 Compares details for agreement or disagreement. [3–4]

Level 4 Compares details for both agreement and disagreement. [5–6]

Level 5 Compares overall message.

Disagree in A all Fascists benefit.  
in B Hitler benefits.

Agree in both sources Fascists benefit. [7]

#### 2 Study sources C and D. Does source D make you surprised by C? Explain your answer using details of the source and your knowledge.

Level 1 Writes about sources, fails to address the question. [1]

Level 2 Undeveloped provenance.

e.g. one Spanish / one British, therefore they see it differently. Also different times,  
therefore not surprised. [2]

Level 3 Expresses surprise based on comparison of content.

e.g. say different things therefore surprised. [3–4]

Level 4 Ignores D and uses contextual knowledge to explain whether surprised or not by C. [4–5]

Level 5 States not surprised because of time of sources. States things may have changed, uses source content but no contextual knowledge. [5–6]

Level 6 Uses context of sources to produce explanation of why surprised / not surprised.  
NB: must use C and D together. [7]

<b>Page 5</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2010</b>	<b>0470</b>	<b>23</b>

**3 Study source E. How reliable is this source? Explain your answer using the details of the source and your knowledge.**

Level 1 Unsupported assertions. [1]

Level 2 Undeveloped provenance. [2]

Level 3 Either uses language / tone of source to suggest bias.  
Or explains internal contradictions in E. [3–4]

Level 4 Cross reference to check E to support whether it is reliable or not reliable. [5]

Level 5 Cross reference to check E to support whether it is reliable and not reliable. [6–7]

Level 6 Uses overall impression to argue E is not reliable.

e.g. It is a Nationalist message, it presents Spain as strong and not weak. [8]

**4 Study sources F and G. Must one of these sources be wrong? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your knowledge.**

Level 1 Paraphrases sources, does not answer the question. [1]

Level 2 Answers based on provenance / time. [2–3]

Level 3 Uses differences to suggest one must be wrong. [4–5]

Level 4 Cross references to show how one is right or wrong or both. Based on one source. [6–7]

Level 5 Cross references to show how one is right or wrong or both. Based on both sources. [8]

**5 Study sources H and I. How similar are the messages of these two cartoons? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your knowledge.**

Level 1 Surface description, offers no comparison. [1]

Level 2 Answer based on sensible misinterpretation.

e.g. British are stupid, they are unaware of what is going on. [2–3]

Level 3 A valid interpretation of one or both cartoons but no comparison. [4–5]

Level 4 Comparison of valid sub-message(s). [6–7]

Level 5 Compares the big message.

i.e. Britain deluding itself re. domination of Spain by Germany and Italy. [8]

<b>Page 6</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2010</b>	<b>0470</b>	<b>23</b>

**6 How far do these sources provide convincing evidence that German intervention in Spain benefited Franco more than Hitler? Use the sources to explain your answer.**

Level 1 No valid source use. [1–3]

Level 2 Uses sources to support or reject the statement. [4–6]

Level 3 Uses sources to support and reject the statement. [7–10]

Award up to two bonus marks for any evaluation of sources  
(no more than one mark per source).

Source use must be reference to a source by letter, by provenance or by a direct quote.  
There must be examples from source content.

Use Y in the margin for each source in support of the statement and N for each rejection  
of the statement.